Plain and Ion-Pair Thin-Layer Chromatography of Synthetic Dyes on an Admixture of Silica Gel G and Barium Sulfate in an Aqueous Ethanol System

Aditya K. Misra* and Upasana Gupta

Department of Chemistry, NMSN Dass (PG) College, Budaun-243601, U.P., India

Abstract

An easy, inexpensive, and accurate method for the analysis of synthetic dyes by means of ion-pair thin-layer chromatography (IPTLC) on mixed sorbent phases containing silica gel G and barium sulfate in an aqueous ethanol system is studied. The effect of the composition of the sorbent phases has a major effect on the hundred-fold relative migration rate, as also does the effect of the ion-pairing reagent as the impregnant. Compact and sharp spot application yields very good binary and ternary separations and enables their clear identification. IPTLC has better separations on mixed sorbent phases, which are not possible on plain mixed phases in thin-layer chromatography. The method can be applied for the trace analysis of synthetic dyes in various natural and synthetic samples.

Introduction

Synthetic dyes are used for decoration and attraction purposes for various food stuff and other substances such as syrups, medicines, leather, and clothes from ancient times. The separation of dyes is often difficult because of spot tailing and close relative migration rate (R_f) values. The separation mechanism is still complicated and not well-understood (1). Most of the dyes have diazo and amino groups and are often carcinogenic in nature with prolonged use and contact. Their use in cosmetics and other health-care products, food stuff, and toys is still prevalent. The use of banned colors and synthetic dyes that are used in biological strains and other areas may also cause health hazards, such as skin diseases or malignancies. Thus, their identification and separation is of great importance in the field of analytical chemistry. We have made some successful attempts in this direction using inorganic ion exchangers (2), reversed-phase silica gel G layers (3), and egg shell layers (4). A silica gel impregnated with inorganic salts (5–9) that have the tendency to form complexes with dyes has also been used by several workers to obtain clear and compact spots, but a clear mechanism has not yet been given. The admixture of barium sulfate and silica gel G has shown a high potential for the separation of herbicides and related compounds (10). Barium sulfate is a highly insoluble, nontoxic, cheap, and chemically inert material (11) and can be used as an adsorbent (12–17).

The use of an ion-pair reagent is a useful method for obtaining acceptable chromatography of polar and ionizable compounds (18). The use of such reagents is possible with a wide range of stationary phases (19–23). Tetra alkyl ammonium compounds (24) have proved useful as ion-pair reagents for the separation of acids. Alkyl sulfonates (25) and alkyl sulfates (26) have been successfully used for the separation of bases. By altering the type (25), concentration of ion-pair reagents (24,26), and the composition of the solvent (27), it is possible to vary the retention of the sample substances and the selectivity of the chromatographic system. Little attention has been given to developing separations for the resolution of food dyes using ion-pair reagents (28). Soap and micellar reversed-phase thin-layer chromatography (TLC) have also been used by Lepri et al. (29) and Shtykov et al. (30), respectively, which are also types of ion-pair TLC (IPTLC). These studies have given us impetus to extend our work on chromatographic studies using impregnated mixed sorbent layers. The admixtures of silica gel G and barium sulfate of different ratios have been used after impregnation with tetra decyltrimethyl ammonium bromide as an ion-pair reagent (10). An aqueous ethanol system was selected as the mobile phase on the basis of our earlier experiences (12).

IPTLC has more possibilities for the separation of synthetic dyes on the admixture of silica gel G and barium sulfate. The spots are more compact and sharper appearing on ion-pair impregnated layers than on plain layers. Several analytically and industrially important binary and ternary separations have been actually achieved as a result of such studies. The dye mixture shows no changes in the hundred-fold R_f (hR_f) values compared with individual dyes, and the separations are reproducible. The

^{*} Author to whom correspondence should be addressed: email akmisra1234@hotmail.com. Current address: 20, Saudagaran, Bareilly-243003, U.P., India.

method can be applied for the separation, identification, and determination of dyes in trace quantities from toys, medicines, and food stuffs after extraction.

Experimental

Apparatus

A Stahl apparatus with a universal applicator (adjustable thick-

ness of the applied layer from 0.25 to 2.00 mm), hot-air electric drier, glass plates (15×3 cm), glass jars (20×5 cm), separating funnel, graduated micropipette with vaccupet control, and a temperature-controlled electric oven (Jindal India, New Delhi, India) were used.

Chemicals and reagents

Silica gel G powder, barium sulfate, and ethanol were obtained from E Merck India (Bombay, India). The dyes were obtained

| Table I. Names, Abbreviations, and Structural Formulas of the Dyes Investigated | | | | | | | | |
|---|--------------|--|------------------|--------------|--|--|--|--|
| Dye | Abbreviation | Structure | Dye | Abbreviation | Structure | | | |
| Crystal violet | CrV | | Pan S | PS | | | | |
| Gentian violet | GnV | Mixture of CrV and MV | | | | | | |
| Hematoxylin | Hm | | Methyl red | MR | | | | |
| Bismark brown | Bb | | Naphthol green B | NgB | 3 Nao, 5 Fe | | | |
| Lacmoid | La | $C_{12}H_9O_3N$ | Fasin | г | Вг | | | |
| Resorcinol blue | Rb | o,š- H, h H, | EOSIN | E | | | | |
| Fuchsin basic | FB | $C_{20}H_{20}\mbox{NCI}$ (mixture of chlorides of pararosaniline, rosaniline, and new magenta) | | | HO | | | |
| Amido swatz | AS | | Bromothylmol blu | ie BtB | (CH,),HC | | | |
| Curcumin S | CrS | | Indigo carmine | IC | | | | |
| Eriochrome back ⁻ | T EBT | | Rhodamine B | Rh | (C,H,J,N,C,H,J, c,COOH | | | |
| Bromophenol blue | e BrB | | Methyl violet | MV | (CH,),N C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C | | | |
| Brilliant green | BrG | $(C_{\lambda}H_{\lambda})_{\lambda}\dot{N}$ | Alizarin red S | ArS | С С С С С С С С С С С С С С С С С С С | | | |
| Safranine | S | | | | SO,Na | | | |
| Orange G | OrG | | Sudan black | SB | | | | |

Table II. hR_f Values of Synthetic Dyes on Different Mixed Stationary Phases with and without Impregnation with the Ion-Pair Reagent in the Ethanol–Water (80:20) System

| | | Coatings [†] | | | | | | | | |
|-------|-----------------|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Dyes* | A ₁ | A_2 | B ₁ | B ₂ | C ₁ | C ₂ | D ₁ | D ₂ | E ₁ | E ₂ |
| CrV | 54 [‡] | 15 | 60 | 24 | 62 | 62 [‡] | 59 | 58 | 44 | 69 |
| GnV | 19 | 10 | 56 | 20 | 54 | 37 | 40 | 66 [‡] | 45 | 49 |
| Hm | 44§ | 39 | 50§ | 42 | 50§ | 42‡ | 50§ | 45 [‡] | 50§ | 24 [‡] |
| Bb | 50 [§] | 31 [‡] | 36 [§] | 16 | 42 | 45 [‡] | 45 [§] | 36 | 46 [§] | 30 [‡] |
| La | 96 | 41 | 96 | 94 | 92 | 95 | 92 | 86 | 92 | 68 |
| Rb | 86 | 64 | 23 | 12 | 10 | 4 | 7 | 0 | 3 | 0 |
| FB | 59 | 24 | 73 | 36 | 81 | 64 [‡] | 65 | 50 [‡] | 91 | 69 |
| AS | 93 | 55 | 89 | 34 | 87 | 84 | 69 | 37 | 51 | 29 [‡] |
| CrS | 50 [§] | 91 | 50§ | 12 | 50§ | 6 | 50§ | 0 | 50§ | 0 |
| EBT | 48 | 91 | 50 [§] | 39 | 50 [§] | 47 [‡] | 50 [§] | 0 | 50 [§] | 0 |
| BrB | 96 | 89 | 93 | 83 | 91 | 79 | 88 | 85 | 95 | 65 |
| BrG | 51‡ | 29 [‡] | 70 | 29 | 63 | 55‡ | 47 | 38‡ | 75 | 49 |
| S | 23 | 19 | 60 | 22 | 46 | 59 | 42 | 69 | 63 | 63 |
| BtB | 93 | 91 | 93 | 84 | 94 | 87 | 86 | 84 | 95 | 59 |
| PS | 87 | 78 | 65 [‡] | 33 | 83 | 77 | 31‡ | 50 | 44 [‡] | 37‡ |
| MR | 89 | 87 | 86 | 66 | 88 | 76 | 65 | 87 | 92 | 38 [‡] |
| NgB | 90 | 93 | 50 [§] | 61 | 50 [§] | 7 | 41 [§] | 16 [‡] | 20 | 21 [‡] |
| E | 93 | 91 | 93 | 55 | 88 | 81 | 86 | 58 | 93 | 59 |
| OrG | 89 | 89 | 83 | 65 | 86 | 79 | 79 | 58 | 87 | 58 |
| IC | 91 | 89 | 50 [§] | 49 | 50 [§] | 48 [‡] | 50 [§] | 30 [‡] | 33 [‡] | 29 [‡] |
| Rh | 32/68 | 66 | 56/75 | 32 | 27/59 | 44/67 | 54 | 87 | 86 | 47/58 |
| MV | 28 | 18 | 25 | 24 | 40 | 51‡ | 13 | 43 [‡] | 35 [‡] | 7/45 |
| ArS | 18/85 | 43 [‡] | 25 | 15 | 40 [§] | 19 [‡] | 13 | 19 | 12 | 0 |
| SB | 86 | 72 | 56 | 35 | 64 | 51‡ | 25‡ | 86 | 25 [‡] | 85 |

* Explanation of dye abbreviations appears in Table I.

⁺ As per experimental.

[‡] Tailing.

§ Steak.

Table III. Various Binary and Ternary Separations of Synthetic Dyes Achieved on the Admixture of Silica Gel G and Barium Sulfate Layers Impregnated with the Ion-Pair Reagent*

| Coating | Separations (R _T -R _L) | Coating | Separations (R _T -R _L) | | | |
|------------------|--|----------------|--|--|--|--|
| A ₂ | CrV(0.05–0.25)/S(0.13–0.25) – Rb(0.60–68)–BtB(0.88–0.93) | B ₂ | CrV(0.13–0.34)–BrB(0.80–0.85)/BtB(0.78–0.90)/ MR (0.61–0.70) | | | |
| | FB(0.15–0.32)–Rh(0.58–0.74)–NgB(0.90–0.96) CrV(0.05–0.25)/GnV(0.06–0.14)–As(0.52–0.57)–CrS (0.82–1.0)/BtB(0.88–0.93) Pb(0.60, 0.68)/AS(0.52, 0. | | AS(0.26-0.41)/IC(0.42-0.52)-BrB(0.80-0.85)/ BtB(0.78-0.90)/MR(0.61-70)/ OrG(0.60-0.69) | | | |
| | 57)/La(0.30–0.52)–CrS(0.82–1.0)/EBT(0.84–0.97)/BrB | C ₂ | Rb(0.00)-GnV(0.29-0.44)-MR(0.69-0.82) | | | |
| | (0.85–0.93)/BtB(0.88–0.93)/NgB(0.90–0.96)/E(0.86–0 .95)/OrG(0.88–0.93)/IC(0.85–0.83) | | CrS(0.00-0.12)-GnV(0.29-0.44)-La(0.84-0.95) | | | |
| | S(0.13-0.25)-CrS(0.82-1.0)/EBT(0.84-0.97)/BtB(0.88 | | NgB(0.00-0.14)-GnV(0.29-0.44)-AS(0.81-0.86) | | | |
| | -0.93)/BrB(0.85-0.93)/NgB(0.90-0.96)E(0.88-0.95)/ OrG(0.88-0.93)/IC(0.85-0.93)/AS(0.52-0.57)/Rb(0.60 -0.68)/SB(0.57-0.86) | | GnV(0.29-0.44)-BrG(0.74-0.82)/BtB(0.83-0.91)/ PS(0.71-0.83)/MR(0.64-0.82)/E(0.78-0.82)/ OrG(0.74-0.84) | | | |
| B ₂ | E(0.45-0.64)/NgB(0.54-0.68)-La(0.88-1.0) | _ | | | | |
| | OrG(0.60-0.69)-La(0.88-1.0) | D_2 | CrS(0.00)/SB(0.00)/Rb(0.00)/EBT(0.00)-La(0.82-0.89)/ BrR(0.75, 0.95)/BrB(0.82, 0.86)/PS(0.34, 0.66)/ | | | |
| | E(0.45–0.64)–BrB(0.80–0.85) | | MR(0.83–0.91)/OrG(0.48–67)/Rh(0.80–0.94) | | | |
| * Explanation of | dye abbreviations appears in Table I. | E2 | EBT(0.00)/CrS(0.00)/ArS(0.00)/SB(0.00)-FB(0.62-0.76) | | | |
| | | | | | | |

from B.D.H. Poole (Poole, U.K.). The ion-pairing reagent (Cetrilak) was obtained from Shalaks Pharmaceuticals Pvt. Ltd. India (New Delhi, India), and all other reagents of analar grade were used.

Preparation of plates

Plates of 0.25-mm thickness were prepared by a slurry obtained by mixing silica gel G powder and barium sulfate powder in different ratios with a 1% ethanolic solution of the ion-pairing reagent and distilled water (DW). The plates were first allowed to dry at room temperature and then at 80°C for 1 h in a hot air oven.

The different coatings (12) that were made to prepare TLC plates were as follows: coating A_1 was plain silica gel G; coating A_2 was plain silica gel G + 1% ethanolic solution of the ion-





pairing reagent + DW; coating B_1 was silica gel G + barium sulfate (80:20) + DW; coating B_2 was silica gel G + barium sulfate (80:20) + 1% ethanolic solution of the ion-pairing reagent + DW; coating C₁ was silica gel G + barium sulfate (60:40) + DW; coating C₂ was silica gel G + barium sulfate (60:40) + 1% ethanolic solution of the ion-pairing reagent + DW; coating D₁ was silica gel G + barium sulfate (40:60) + DW; coating D₂ was silica gel G + barium sulfate (40:60) + 1% ethanolic solution of the ion-pairing reagent + DW; coating D₂ was silica gel G + barium sulfate (40:60) + 1% ethanolic solution of the ion-pairing reagent + DW; coating E G + barium sulfate (20:80) + DW; and coating E₂ was silica gel G + barium sulfate (20:80) + 1% ethanolic solution of the ion-pairing reagent + DW.

The plates of pure barium sulfate could not be made because of their cracking upon drying.

Preparation of test solutions

Test solutions of synthetic dyes $(10^{-3}M)$ were prepared in ethanol–water (4:1, v/v). All dyes are self-visualized compounds.

Method

The test solutions (500 ng) were applied on TLC plates at approximately 1.5 cm above their lower edge by means of a micropipette. The spots were dried with the help of hot air, and plates were developed with an ethanol–water (80:20) mobile phase. The solvent ascent was fixed to 10 cm above the point of application. After development the plates were removed from the jars and dried at room temperature. The spots were self-visualized. The values for the rear (R_T) and front (R_L) limits of the spot were measured in the usual way (10):

$$R_f = \frac{(R_T + R_L)/2}{10}$$
 Eq. 1

and

$$hR_f = R_f \times 100$$
 Eq. 2

Results and Discussion

Table I presents the structure and abbreviations of synthetic dyes because the structure plays an important role in the migration process (31), and Tables II and III give an account of hR_f values in various solvent systems along with the binary and ternary separations achieved on impregnated sorbents. The hR_f values of the synthetic dyes were plotted against the solvent system on

plain as well as ion-pair impregnated mixed adsorbent layers (Figures 1 and 2). The earlier investigations and the work carried out in this laboratory (2,3,10) revealed that thin layers of silica gel G do not vield satisfactory separations because of high hR_{f} values and tailing in several cases. Thin layers of pure barium sulfate cannot be prepared because of cracking. However, the admixture of both silica gel G and barium sulfate has some separation potential for synthetic dyes (12) and yields limited binary separations in an ethanol-water (80:20) system. Although the silica gel G ion-pair impregnated layers gave clear and satisfactory separation, the 1% impregnation gave better results because of the fact that the critical micelle concentration (CMC) value of the ion-pairing reagent was 0.036M or approximately 1%. Ethanol of an approximately 80% concentration lowers the CMC values of long-chain guaternary ammonium salts, thus the ethanol-water system (80:20) was used for this study by using a



Figure 2. hR_f values of various dyes on plain and ion-pair reagent impregnated coatings (the solid lines are the hR_f values on plain layers and the segmented lines are the hR_f values on impregnated layers): (•) main spot, (**A**) second spot in an ethanol–water (80:20) system, (A) plain silica gel G, (B) admixture of silica gel G and barium sulfate (80:20), (C) admixture of silica gel G and barium sulfate (40:60), and (E) admixture of silica gel G and barium sulfate (20:80).

silica-based mixed inexpensive adsorbent in IPTLC. As the barium sulfate was mixed in silica gel G, the development time was also increased. The additional increase of ion-pair reagent further increased the development time to some extent while the hR_f values decreased in comparison with the normal plates made up of mixed adsorbent. The main reason for using the TLC plates impregnated with the ion-pair reagent was that the inclusion of reagent in the solvent alone does not usually lead to acceptable chromatography. The reason appears to be that the reagent migrates more slowly than the solvent front. Thus, the sample does not have an opportunity for ion-pair formation.

Cetyl trimethyl ammonium bromide (CTMA) is asymmetrical and has its quaternary nitrogen placed at one end of a long lipophilic alkyl chain, thus its water solubility is lower than other quaternary ammonium salts. Therefore, CTMA gives a quite different layer when coated onto TLC plates. The silica gel has

silanol groups that are available to interact with the ion-pair reagent, thus a lipophilic layer is formed on the surface of the silica gel G. The tails of further CTMA molecules might sit with their hydrophilic and ion-pairing ends protruding into the aqueous mobile phase. This enables the CTMA to act with an ion-exchange (or ion-interaction) mechanism for the ionizable and polar compounds such as synthetic dyes chromatographed on such plates. This is because of the fact that the hR_f values were decreased on silica gel G impregnated with CTMA in comparison with pure silica gel G. In several cases other dyes were unaffected or developed slightly decreased hR_f values. As barium sulfate was mixed, the silanol groups were not as available for the interaction of the ion-pairing molecule, and basic dyes show an increase in hR_f values because they do not form ion pairs with CTMA (but it was less than the plain mixed adsorbent layer). With the addition of more barium sulfate (60:40) more silanol groups were covered by the barium sulfate molecules and more of the ion-pair reagent was available for the anionic dyes to form ion pairs with the CTMA and move more rapidly. It may also be possible that 0.1M CTMA is soluble in water and sufficiently polar enough to migrate in the solvent front, thus forming ion pairs with several synthetic dyes that were not affected by the admixture (60:40). This is more evident by the fact that the addition of more barium sulfate acted in the adsorption phenomenon and the admixture ratios of 40:60 and 20:80 for silica gel G-barium sulfate, respectively, gave lower hR_f values in several cases (with the exception of Sudan black and crystal violet). Fuschin basic is highly soluble in both water and alcohol and was not adsorbed on the D_1 , D_2 , E_1 , and E_2 layers.

A close examination of Table II shows that the anionic dyes bromophenol blue, orange G, methyl red, naphthol green B, eosin, bromothymol blue, and indigo carmine had no major change in hR_f on plain and impregnated silica gel layers in the ethanol–water system. The exceptions were eriochrome black T (which showed a high increase in hR_f values on the impregnated layer) and anionic amphoteric dye amido swartz (which showed a sharp decrease in hR_f values on impregnated silica gel G layers (A₂)).

However, the cationic dyes (crystal violet, gentiant violet, hematoxylin, bismark brown, fuschin basic, brilliant green, safranin, pan S, methyl violet, and nonionic Sudan black) (which do not form ion pairs with CTMA) showed a decrease in h_f on impregnated silica gel G layers in the same solvent system.

Figures 1 and 2 depict that the basic dyes crystal violet, gentiant violet, hematoxylin, lacmoid, and fuschin basic with the addition of barium sulfate in silica gel G show a sharp increase in $hR_{\rm f}$ values followed by a decrease. The $hR_{\rm f}$ values for these dyes were generally higher on coated C_2 layers. In other cases the hR_f values decreased with the addition of barium sulfate (i.e., an 80:20 ratio (B_2 layer) then increased up to a ratio of 60:40. A further addition of barium sulfate caused hR_{f} values to decrease or remain unaffected by the adsorbent layer as discussed previously. It can be seen that all the dyes had lower $hR_{\rm f}$ values on impregnated layers than on plain adsorbent layers without any regard to their structure and nature. Figures 1 and 2 also indicate that no definite pattern was found and several phenomena were likely involved. These include the adsorption of dyes on the different types of layers, the ion-exchange behavior of the mixed adsorbent layers resulting from the presence of the CTMA impregnant, hydrogen bonding, steric effect, and differential solubilities of dyes in the ethanol-water system. On the basis of R_T-R_L values a large number of binary and ternary separations have been achieved, which cannot be achieved on plain admixed layers of silica gel G and barium sulfate (10) (represented in Table III).

Conclusion

The ion-pair impregnated silica gel G and barium sulfate admixed layers have a better separation potential for the synthetic dyes, and the ion-pair separations of dyes of analytical and industrial importance can be easily achieved. Plain admixed layers show very limited separations.

This method is useful for separating dyes from toys, cosmetics, food stuffs, and drugs after extraction with the help of this ionpair reagent (28). Further studies in this direction are in progress with real samples.

Acknowledgments

The authors are thankful to Prof. K.G. Varshney (Professor & Head Department of Applied Chemistry, Faculty of Engineering

& Technology, Aligarh Muslim University, Aligargh, India) for his helpful suggestions and discussion. Thanks are also due to the State Council of Science & Technology (U.P., India) for financial support.

References

- V.K. Gupta. "Synthetic Dyes". In Handbook of Thin Layer Chromatography. J. Sherma and B. Fried, Eds. Marcel Dekker Inc., New York, NY, 1990, p 939.
- A.K. Misra. Thin layer chromatography of synthetic dyes on antimonic acid and on admixture of antimonic acid and silica gel "G" in a mixed solvent system. J. Liq. Chromatogr. 14: 1461–67 (1991).
- D.K. Misra. "Chromatographic Studies of Some Organics and Inorganics". Ph.D. Thesis, Rohilkhand University, U.P., India, 1990.
- A.K. Misra, P.S. Saxena, and U. Gapta. Chromatographic behaviour of synthetic dyes on unconventional layers. *Ind. J. Chem. Technol.*, in press.
- J.W. Copius-Peereboam and H.W. Beekes. TLC of synthetic dyes on poly amide and silver nitrate (-silica gel) layers. *J. Chromatogr.* 20: 43–47 (1965).
- S.P. Srivastava, L.S. Chauhan, and V.K. Dua. Chromatographic separation of closely related dyes on metal salts impregnated thin layers. *J. Liq. Chromatogr.* 3: 1929–36 (1980).
- S.P. Srivastava, R. Bhushan, and R.S. Chauhan. TLC separation of some close related synthetic dyes on impregnated silica gel "G" layers. J. Liq. Chromatogr. 8: 1255–63 (1985).
- V.K. Gupta. TLC separation of closely related synthetic dyes. J. Liq. Chromatogr. 9: 3489–93 (1986).
- V.K. Gupta, I. Ali, and A. Joshi. TLC separation of synthetic dyes on silica gel layers impregnated with nickel (II) ion. *J. Ind. Chem. Soc.* 68: 311–12 (1991).
- A.K. Misra, S. Pachauree, and U. Gupta. Plain & ion pair thin layer chromatography of some herbicides and related compounds on admixture of silica gel "G" and barium sulphate in a single solvent system. *Ind. J. Chem. Technol.* 8: 408–12 (2001).
- J.W. Mellar. A Comprehensive Treatise on Inorganic and Theoretical Chemistry. Longmans, Williams Clowes and Sons Ltd. London, U.K., 1961, Vol. 3, p 777.
- 12. A.K. Misra and U. Gupta. Chromatography of synthetic dyes on mixed sorbent layers. *J. Ind. Chem. Soc.*, in press.
- N.M. Sanghavi and S.I. Khatib. Barium sulphate as an adsorbent in TLC for analysis of drugs I. *Indian Drugs* 19: 319–22 (1982).
- P.R. Kamath and N.M. Sanghavi. Barium sulphate as an adsorbent in TLC for analysis of pharmaceuticals. *Indian Drugs* 22: 336–38 (1985).
- H.S. Rathore and H.A. Khan. Characterization of barium sulphate as a TLC material for the separation of plant carboxylic acid. *Chromatographia* 23: 432–34 (1987).
- H.S. Rathore and H.A. Khan. Plain TLC of some herbicides and related compounds on admixtures of barium sulphate and calcium sulphate in mixed solvents. J. Liq. Chromatogr. 11: 3171–81 (1988).
- H.S. Rathore, I. Ali, and H.A. Khan. Quantitative chromatographic separation of trichloroacetic acid from some carboxylic herbicides on BaSO₄–CaSO₄ coatings impregnated with coconut oil. *J. Planar Chromatogr. Mod.-TLC* 1: 252–54 (1988).
- G.P. Tomkinson, I.D. Wilson, and R.J. Ruane. Reverse phase ion pair high performance thin layer chromatography of aromatic acids on cynopropyl bonded silica gel "G". J. Planar Chromatogr. Mod.-TLC 3: 491–99 (1990).
- S. Lewis and I.D. Wilson. Factors affecting the ion pair reverse phase thin layer chromatography of aromatic acids on paraffin coated and C₁₈ bonded silica gel. *J. Chromatogr.* **312**: 133–40 (1984).
- I.D. Wilson. Ion pair reverse phase thin layer chromatography of organic acids: Reinvestigation of the affect of solvent pH on R_f values. J. Chromatogr. 354: 99–106 (1986).

- J.A. Troke and I.D. Wilson. Reverse phase ion pair thin layer chromatography of organic acids influence of ion pair structure and solvent pH on R_f values. *J. Chromatogr.* **360**: 236–40 (1986).
- R.J. Ruane and I.D. Wilson. Normal and reverse phase ion pair thin layer chromatography with bifunctional (bolform) bis (trimethyl ammonium) ion pair reagents. J. Chromatogr. 368: 168–73 (1986).
- G.P. Tomkinson, I.D. Wilson, and R.J. Raune. Reverse phase ion pair high performance thin layer chromatography of acids on C₂ bonded silica gel. *J. Planar Chromatogr. Mod.-TLC* 2: 224–27 (1989).
- C.T. Hung and R.B. Taylor. Mechanism of retention of acidic solutes by octadecyl silica using quaternary ammonium pairing ions as ion exchangers. J. Chromatogr. 202: 333–45 (1980).
- J.B. Landis, M.E. Grant, and S.A. Nelson. Determination of clindamycin in pharmaceuticals by high performance liquid chromatography using ion pair formation. *J. Chromatogr.* 202: 99–106 (1980).
- H.H. Van Rooij, R.L. Waterman, and J.C. Kraak. Dynamic cation exchange systems for the separation of drugs derived from butyrophenon and diphenylpiperidine by high performance liquid chro-

matography and applied indetermination of halopemide in plasma. *J. Chromatogr.* **164:** 177–85 (1979).

- 27. W. Jost, K. Unger, and G. Schill. Reverse phase ion pair chromatography of polyvalent ions using oligonucleotides as model substance. *Anal. Biochem.* **119:** 214–23 (1982).
- C. Van Peteghem and J. Bijl. Ion pair extraction and ion pair adsorption thin layer chromatography for the rapid identification of ionic food dyes. *J. Chromatogr.* **210**: 113–20 (1981).
- L. Lepri, P.G. Desideri, and V. Coas. Separation and identification of water soluble food dyes by ion exchange and soap thin layer chromatography. *J. Chromatogr.* 161: 279–86 (1978).
- S.N. Shtykov, E.G. Sumina, E.V. Smushkina, and N.V. Tyuyina. Normal and reverse phase thin layer chromatography of fluorescein dyes with aqueous micellar solutions as mobile phases. *J. Planar Chromatogr. Mod.-TLC* 12: 129–34 (1999).
- 31. A.K. Misra and S. Pachauree. Retention behaviour of synthetic dyes on zerconium (IV) phosphoantimonate papers. *Acta Chromatographica* **11**: 139–53 (2001).

Manuscript accepted February 25, 2002.